

EVALUATION OF TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM BASED ON CIPP MODEL IN THE REGION OF BALUCHISTAN, PAKISTAN

Muhammad Tariq

*Norlidah Alias

Faculty of Education

Universiti Malaya

*drnorlidah@um.edu.my

Abstract: The quality of teacher education in Pakistan has always been a huge concern for the stakeholders and as a result of which they have initiated a new teacher education program in form of B.Ed. (Hons) with the support of USAID. Now it is required to assess the new program time to time in order to highlight its weak areas and bring improvement. Thus, this study aimed to evaluate teacher education program in the region of Baluchistan, Pakistan through the perspectives of teachers and administrators on the basis of context, input, process and product (CIPP) model. The population comprised of teachers and administrators attached with teacher education program at different universities in the region of Baluchistan, Pakistan. The data has been obtained through 26- items questionnaires and a semi-structured interview. In this study, data were analyzed by using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS-22) and thematic analysis.

The findings of the study indicated that the participants of survey mostly agree on the context, input, process and product components of the program. However, they were dissatisfied with the content of the curriculum which is too lengthy for the students who do not have much background knowledge about teacher education at this stage. Furthermore, the participants of the interview revealed that there are problems with the time allocation for classroom exercise, teaching practice is not paid attention to, content is lengthy and audio-visual materials were not used complement to teaching methods. Thus, this study recommended including teaching practice in every semester and make the teachers part of the committee while developing the curriculum of the program and suggest that the audio-visual tools of the curriculum need to be varied and utilized to complement teaching methods and further suggested students' prior knowledge should be considered while developing the curriculum.

Keywords: *Teacher Education, CIPP Model, Curriculum, USAID, Teaching Practice*

INTRODUCTION

It is the requirement of every institution to design the educational programs in such a way to gain particular objectives and to make sure that the specific objectives are met, it is essential to go through evaluation process so that the stakeholders can make a proper decision whether to proceed with this program or need to bring improvements and revision in it. It has become an increasing demand for evaluation of higher education on academic quality which in return contributes to accountability among authorities and has impact on university ranking (Rossi, 2004). Stufflebeam (1971) states that the main aim of evaluating a program is to concentrate on objectives achievement in order to make alternative decision.

During the new years, quick progression in the field of science and innovation has requested changes in the current educational plans for degree programs at present offered by different colleges of the country. The patterns in schooling have changed quickly over the couple of years on the global scene (Haider, 2008). The government of Pakistan has shown a distinct fascination for rolling out thorough improvements in degree projects to eliminate all errors in the global norm. Therefore, Bachelor of Studies (BS) 4-Year program was consequently started in Pakistan in 2002 with the suggestions of the higher schooling commission and the National educational plan correction panel. This is a totally new program, presented with the point of setting up the understudies of this locale to contend with understudies at worldwide level and to foster the linkage between the neighborhood and unfamiliar foundations. This program has been assuming lucky part to empower the understudies to get etymological, abstract, open, basic, social and humanistic abilities (Bahauddin Zakariya University, 2009). Being the part of instructor training, the analyst noticed the viability of BS Instruction program. Keeping in view the significance of BS 4-Year Program and finding that no minimized and extensive examination study has yet been accomplished for the assessment of BS 4-Year Program in Education. Thus the researcher has taken this specific theme for the current study.

In Pakistan, there are many issues and problems related to quality and education access in education sector which are improving bad situation of school structure, absence of schools in public sector, developing logical skills in students. Major reasons in low level learning and quality education are weak classroom management, inadequate school environment, poor qualification of teachers, lack of content knowledge and old teaching methodologies (Ministry of Education, 2009). A survey showed that seven million children are out of school in Pakistan. Therefore government of Pakistan with different NGOs and international development partners take many efforts to solve these problems (Ministry of Education, 2009).

Pakistan is a South Asian country situated near the Arabian Sea and the Gulf of Oman which has the sixth biggest population in the world and second largest populated country among Muslim countries after Indonesia. It is a developing nation with an underdeveloped economy and education system. The land of Pakistan is divided into four provinces (Punjab, Sindh, KPK and Balochistan) with capital territory and tribal areas (Amanda Briney, 2018). Punjab has the biggest population with 56% of country population.

Balochistan being the largest province of Pakistan in term of land which contributes 44% area is the least and most underdeveloped province of Pakistan. Majority of the population in Balochistan live in small villages and towns who lack access to quality education (Government of Balochistan, 2011). Educational attainment in this province is lower than other provinces which show backwardness of education sector in Balochistan. There are a lot of causes for poor performance such as ineffective plans and policies, not enough schools, lack of check and balance mechanism for providing professional support for teachers and old content of teacher preparation program (Memon, 2006).

Presently, the teacher preparation programs in Pakistan are facing many issues which are negatively effecting overall effectiveness of education system (Muhammad, 2007). It is an urgent need to evaluate in order to recognize its weak areas to bring improvement (Saima, 2013). The present study aims to evaluate the newly initiated teacher education program of B.Ed. (Hons) which was introduced in 2009 in the region of Balochistan, Pakistan on the basis of CIPP evaluation model.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Design

It is an evaluative type of study that aims to identify perception of teachers and administrators about B.Ed. (Hons) program. In pursuing the objectives, this study will employ the survey technique and interview. In general, researchers used survey as it is a more pertinent research technique for primary data collection. The survey research design is relevant for many types of research and survey beneficial in demonstrating the features of a large population. This technique can offer a wide-ranging capacity which allows for a specific sample to collect desired results. It is most crucial to select a proper technique to certify data collection process (Bradley & Devadason, 2008). Questionnaire technique is utilized because it is suitable to collect straightforward information about a program (Powell, 2000).

Participants

Population of the study plays an important role which needs to be chosen on priority basis in order to get the most relevant results from it. So, for this study, the population consists of teachers and administrators of B.Ed. honor program at public sector universities in Baluchistan region of Pakistan where this program is being offered.

Instruments

Instruments such as questionnaires and semi-structured interviews were used as main instruments for this study.

Questionnaires

Questionnaire technique is a systematic way to obtain information from a large number of people. The questionnaire supports researchers to manage, collect data and get uniform information from a large target population (Gay, 2012). The questionnaires were constructed based on previous studies (Karatas, 2009; Ulum, 2016). Furthermore, the questionnaires were partitioned into different sections and measured by using Likert Scale of 5 points (1) Strongly Disagree (2) Disagree (3) Neutral (4) Agree (5) Strongly Agree.

Interview Protocol

Interview protocols were made to interview ten university administrators including 5 Deans and 5 Head of Departments at Faculty of Education of public sector universities in the region of Baluchistan, Pakistan. Note taking procedure was utilized during the meetings which were directed separately. The meeting plan comprised of open-finished inquiries identified with the program, as they give important data in obtaining more information as they offer the respondents a chance to communicate their perspectives uninhibitedly. During the meetings, the teachers received some information about the goals of the program and to what degree those destinations were met alongside their sentiments with respect to the strategies, materials, and evaluation measurements of the program.

DATA ANALYSIS

Standard deviation was used for quantitative data and thematic analysis was used for qualitative data.

Limitation of The Study

Every study has some limitations. Creswell (2008) defined limitations as potential weaknesses or problem which can be, inadequate measures of variables, lack of participants, errors in measurement, small sample size and other components linked to data collection and its analysis. So, this study has the following limitations which may have influenced the study consequences.

This study has potential risk of non-response error as whole populations of teachers and administrators were used. The small population size of administrators as compared to teachers who had their perceptions on program might have biased the results in the favor of teachers. Secondly, it lacks external evaluator whose involvement might have better results of the study which has to enhance credibility and objectivity of the evaluation.

This study is limited to teacher education program in Baluchistan which can be used for other programs for improvement such as English as second language where most studies have been done globally but, in Pakistan no studies can be found on this. Another limitation of this study is that it focuses only on Baluchistan region and no other parts of Pakistan. Thirdly, this research is being carried out during Covid-19 pandemic and researcher is physically visiting the respondents to collect data which looks difficult to get responses from all participants.

DATA ANALYSIS AND RESULTS*Demographic Data Analysis of the Teachers*

This section consists of various basic data on the background of the respondents (teachers) such as their gender, age, marital status, qualification, employment status, specialization and experience. The information obtained from the respondents in this section is presented in the form of figures. The population size for teachers was 104. The researcher could approach and distribute 85 and received 68 valid questionnaires which are presented in the following section given below for further clarification.

Reliability of The Instruments of the Teachers

Table 1
Reliability in Total

Cronbach's Alpha	No of items
.945	26

The reliability in total was found to be .945 of 26 items so the scales are highly reliable.

Table 2
Reliability of Sub-Group

Cronbach's Alpha	Cronbach's Alpha	Items
Context	.874	06
Input	.936	06
Process	.961	07
Product	.927	07

[28]

The reliability level of sub-group of scales was between .874 to .961 so the sub-groups are highly reliable.

Descriptive Analysis of Teachers Data

Descriptive analysis statistics are used to describe the basic characteristics of data in a study which provides simple summaries about the sample and observation. Descriptive statistics help to simplify large amount of data in a clear and understandable way. These statistics form the basis of the initial description of the data suitable for a specific study. The collected data were put in SPSS software and analyzed through means and standard deviation.

Results Pertaining to Teachers Perspectives on Context of the Program

In this section, the results of the study and findings are explained on the basis of data collected from the participants by means of the instruments. The results and findings are described on the basis of the research questions which are grouped under the titles of the categories from the questionnaires. Results and discussion related to the views of teachers on teacher education in the areas such as context, input, process, and product in Table 3, 4, 5 and 6. In the first portion of the questionnaire, there are 6 items related to results pertaining to the perspectives of the teachers on the context of the program. The table below clarifies the results pertaining to the views of the teachers on the context of the program.

Table 3
Teachers Perspectives on Context of B.Ed. (Hons) Program

		N	Mean	Std. Deviation
1.	The objectives of the curriculum are clear and achievable.	68	3.94	1.006
2.	The objectives of the curriculum meet the needs of students regarding teacher education program.	68	3.96	.969
3.	The contents of curriculum are in accordance to the student's level.	68	2.04	.781
4.	The contents of the curriculum are comprehensible.	68	4.01	.938
5.	The theoretical and practical framework of curriculum is balanced.	68	3.79	1.100
6.	The teaching material attracts the students' attention.	68	4.15	.797
Valid N (listwise)				

The item no 6 is regarding 'The teaching material attracts the students' attention' that mean (x) score is 4.15. It shows that the item 6 is the most agreed item by the teachers of B.Ed. (Hons) program. The participants agree about this item.

The item no 3 which is 'The contents of the curriculum are in accordance to the student's level' where mean (x) score is 2.04 is the least agreed item. This indicates that this item is not agreed by the participants.

The item 4 'The contents of the curriculum are comprehensible' has mean (x) score 4.01. The score of this item shows that this item is also agreed by the participants.

The item 2' the objectives of the curriculum meet the needs of students regarding teacher education program' whose mean (x) score is 3.96. It indicates that this item is agreed by the participants.

The item 1 'the objectives of curriculum are clear and achievable' and item 5 'which has the mean (x) score 3.94. It too indicates that the participants agree about these items.

For the 5th item, 'the theoretical and practical framework of curriculum is balanced', the mean (x) score is 3.79. The score indicates that participants agree about this item.

For the total perspectives on the context of the program, the mean (x) score is 3.64. The score indicates that the participants are satisfied with the context of the program where average score is higher than the mid-point (2.50). Thus, it is clear from the score that participants agree on the context of the program in total.

Results Pertaining to Teachers Perspective on Input of Program

In the second portion of the questionnaire, there are 6 items related to results pertaining to the perspectives of teachers on the input of B.Ed. (Hons) program. Table 6 clarifies the results related to the views on the input of the program.

Table 4
Teachers Perspectives on Input of B.Ed. (Hons) Program

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
1. Classroom activities enhance the professional skills of the students.	68	4.10	.917
2. Classroom activities promote the concept learning of the students.	68	3.97	1.022
3. The use of audio visual improves the teaching skills of the students.	68	3.87	1.091
4. The use of audio visual materials strengthens the students' attention.	68	4.19	.797
5. The use of audio visual material is beneficial for enhancing critical thinking in the students.	68	4.15	.833
6. The class work of the curriculum helps the students learn easily.	68	4.24	.755
Valid N (listwise)	68		

For item 6, 'the class work of the curriculum helps the students learn easily' the mean (x) score is 4.24 which is the most agreed item for this section. It indicates that participants completely agree with this item.

The item 3, 'the use of audio visual improves the teaching skills of the students' is the least agreed scale among input items where mean (x) score is 3.87. However, it is agreed by the participants.

For the item 4, 'The use of audio visual materials strengthen the students' attention' has the mean (x) score 4.19. The score shows that this item has been agreed by the participants.

The item 2, 'the classroom activities promote the concept learning of the students' has mean (x) score 3.97. The score indicates that this scale is also agreed by the participants.

The item 4, 'Classroom activities enhance the professional skills of the students has mean (x) score 4.10. The result shows that this item is agreed by the participants.

The item 5, 'the use of audio visual materials is beneficial for enhancing critical thinking in students' has mean (x) score 4.15. The finding indicates that this item is agreed by the participants.

Results related to the total perspectives of teachers on the input of the program, the mean (x) score are 4.08. The above mentioned score shows that the participants are satisfied with the input of the program in total where average score of the items is higher than the mid-point (2.5). It indicates clearly that participants agree about the input of the program in total.

Results Pertaining to Teachers Perspective on Process of the Program

This part of questionnaires has 7 items related to results linked to the perspectives of the teachers on the process of the program which aims to specify the perspectives of universities teachers. Furthermore, Table 5 given below describes the results pertaining to the perspectives of the teachers on the process of the program.

Table 5
Teachers Perspectives on Process of B.Ed. (Hons) Program

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
1. The curriculum is supportive in promoting interest in the students to perform activities.	68	4.21	.802
2. Curriculum is flexible for revision.	68	4.07	.919
3. Innovative consolidating homework is assigned to the students.	68	3.97	1.022
4. Time duration of solving questions in the classrooms has been considered in the curriculum.	68	4.15	.851
5. Exercises in the curriculum enhance creative thinking in the students.	68	4.24	.755
6. The activities in the curriculum cover all the teaching skills	68	4.24	.755
7. Activities in the curriculum encourage the group discussion among the students in class	68	4.18	.809
Valid N (listwise)	68		

The item 5, 'exercises in the curriculum enhance creative thinking in the students' and item 6 'the activities in the curriculum cover all the teaching skills' have mean (x) score 4.24. These two items are the most agreed ones in this portion of questionnaires. These scores show that these two items are agreed by the participants.

The item 3, 'innovative consolidating homework is assigned to the students' has mean (x) score 3.97. This item is the least agreed one in this portion. Nevertheless, participants agree on this item.

The item 7, 'activities in the curriculum encourage the group discussion among the students in the classroom' has mean (x) score 4.18. This indicates that this item is also agreed by the participants.

The item 1, 'the curriculum is supporting in promoting interests in the students to perform activities' has mean (x) score 4.21. This score indicates that this item is agreed by the participants.

The item 4, 'time duration of solving questions in the classrooms has been considered in the curriculum' has mean (x) score 4.15. This score also shows that participants agree this item.

The item 2, 'curriculum is flexible for revision' has mean (x) score 4.07. This score shows that this item is too agreed by the participants.

Results pertaining to total perspectives of teachers on the process of the program, the mean (x) score is 4.15. The score indicates that participants are satisfied with the process of the program where the average score of the items is higher than the mid-point (2.5). So it is clear from the score that participants agree about the process of the program in total.

Results Pertaining to Teachers Perspectives on Product of the Program

This part of questionnaires has 7 items related to results pertaining to the perspectives of teachers on the product of the program which aims to specify the perspectives of universities teachers. The Table 6 given below explains the results pertaining to the perspectives of teachers on the product of the program.

Table 6
Teachers Perspectives on the Product of B.Ed. (Hons) Program

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
1. The curriculum strengthens the learning habits in the students.	68	4.21	.764
2. The curriculum motivates the students to actively learn teaching profession.	68	4.18	.772
3. The assigned projects to the students are significant to enhance teaching profession.	68	4.26	.725
4. The curriculum reflects the future professional needs of the students.	68	4.26	.803
5. The curriculum covers all the teaching dimensions.	68	4.16	.924
6. The curriculum contributes to the students' work related with their fields.	68	4.35	.641
7. The curriculum meets the students' individual needs.	68	4.38	.624
Valid N (listwise)	68		

The item 7, 'The curriculum meets the students' individual needs' has mean (\bar{x}) score 4.38. This is the most agreed item by the teachers in this section. The score here indicates that participants have agreed on this item.

The item 5, 'The curriculum covers all the teaching dimensions' has mean score 4.16 which is the least agreed item in this section. However, the score shows that the participants agree about the item.

The item 1, 'The curriculum strengthens the learning habits in the students' has mean (\bar{x}) score 4.21. The score indicates that the participants agree about the item.

The item 2, 'The curriculum motivates the students to actively learn teaching profession' has mean (\bar{x}) score 4.18. The score shows that this item is agreed by the participants.

The item 6, 'the curriculum contributes to the students' work related with their fields' has mean (\bar{x}) score 4.35. The score shows that participants agree about this item.

The item 4, 'The curriculum reflects the future professional needs of the students' has mean (\bar{x}) score 4.26. The score indicates that this item is also agreed by the participants.

The item 3, 'The assigned projects to the students are significant to enhance teaching profession' has mean (\bar{x}) score 4.26. The score indicates that the participants partly agree about this item.

Results pertaining to total perspectives of teachers on the product of the program, the mean (\bar{x}) score is 4.25. This score shows that participants are satisfied with the product of the program in total where average score of the items is higher than mid-point (2.50). Thus, it is clearly seen that participants agree about the product of the program in total.

INTERVIEW RESULTS

In this section, ten administrators including Deans and Heads of Department from the department of education at university level were interviewed about their perspectives on the context, input, process, and product of B.Ed. (Hons) program. The researcher uses thematic analysis technique to analyze the data. The interviews were transcribed and initial coding was conducted and then final coding to take out the themes. The researcher has generated different themes and each theme has been discussed in this section.

Context

The objectives mentioned in the curriculum of teacher education are clear, achievable and according to students' level.

The first theme was based on the objectives of the program. Objectives of a program have a huge role for its success, and it is very much important that objectives are in accordance to the mental level of the students. By looking at theme one, participants were satisfied with the objectives of the program as majority of them mentioned that the objectives of the curriculum are clear and achievable and are according to students' capacity. As one of the respondents mentioned that *'the objectives of B.Ed. (Hons) are clear and easy for the students to comprehend'* (R-5).

The Content of Curriculum Is Lengthy

The success of a program depends on whether its contents are in accordance with students' level, age, needs, interests and prior knowledge. Majority of the participants of the believe that this program is quite lengthy and difficult according to the level, age, interests, needs and background knowledge of the students. As one of the participants mentioned *'In my views, the content of curriculum is too lengthy for the students and students don't have much background knowledge about teacher education program at this stage which is quite new for them. I believe that teacher education program is too crucial so it should be developed according to the level of the students'* (R-1). It is clear from the comments of the above mentioned respondents that teacher education program is crucial for them and it is lengthy for students' level.

Input

Classroom Activities Boost Up Teaching Skills

Classroom activities such as pair-work, group discussion, and classwork are essential in enhancing professional skills of the students so majority of the respondents in this study mentioned that the classroom activities play a key role to boost up teaching skills of the students. Classroom activities in the shape of pair-work, group discussion, use of AVs are helpful for the professional development of the students and one of the participants pointed out *'in my perspective classroom activities are of key importance and are necessary for professional skills development. As professional skills are essential for teaching field and classroom activities are designed for enhancing professional skills development of the students. Classroom activities are the backbone in improving the professional skills of students'* (R-3). As the classroom activities are very much important for the professional development of the students, more focus and time need to be given on this area.

Uses of Audio-Visual Aids Are Not Complement According to Teaching Methods

The use of audio-visual aids are given highest priority in the field of teaching which help to make teaching more interesting and easier for the learners and most of the participants in this study were in the opinion that use of audio-visual materials are helpful for students to improve their teaching skills. However, the use of audio-visual materials are not properly used as one of the respondents mentioned in his point *'If we see AV materials are of great source of help for teachers to teach the students in an easy and comfortable way, but in this study the audio-visual materials are applied in a good way which demands that tools of the curriculum need to be varied and utilized to complement teaching methods'* (R-7).

Process

Curriculum Motivates Students for Activities

It is the top priority of any curriculum to be easy, interesting, attentive and most importantly with accordance to students' mental level so that it can create interest among learners to perform their task and get engaged with it and a curriculum without these qualities cannot be successful. Majority of the participants in this study responded in the favor of this theme that curriculum is supporting in bringing interest among students to perform activities. As the curriculum of this program is equipped with the latest teaching activities, it promotes interest among students to carry out their task on time. One of the respondents mentioned *'curriculum of this program is well-designed to promote interest among the students to perform their task'* (R-10).

Less Time Has Been Kept for Classroom Activities

For a program to be successful, it needs proper time allocation which is one of the foremost requirements besides other requirements. So, in this study, majority of the participants complained about time allocation for classroom

activities which is not sufficient and demanded for more time for classroom activities so that students have sufficient time for each activity to be properly performed. As classroom activities are crucial for the professional development of the students in their field of teaching in the future, allocating less time can affect their performance. One of the participants is in points *'little time has been kept for solving classroom questions which needs to be increased'* (R-1).

Product

Curriculum of B.Ed. (Hons) Motivates Students to Learn Teaching Profession

A curriculum needs to be made balanced and complete in all angles so that more and more students can be dragged towards this field and it is also need of the time that competitive and skillful individuals are demanded to teaching profession and it is only possible when we have an effective curriculum for teacher education program which motivates candidates towards this profession. In this study majority of the respondents responded that the curriculum of this program has capacity to attract students towards teaching profession and encourage them to actively participate in it and according to one of the respondents *'Students are highly motivated and attracted towards teaching profession'* (R-3).

Curriculum Covers All Teaching Areas, But Needs More Time in Teaching Practice

Teaching practice is one the most pivotal parts of teacher training program which needs to be given more attention and time. Teaching practice is considered the backbone of this profession which demands more time and work so that students can better learn it. From the findings of the respondents, it was clear that most of them mentioned that it covers all teaching dimensions, but needs more time in the area of teaching practice as one of the respondents mentioned *'curriculum of teacher education covers all area of teaching, but more time needed for teaching practice'* (R-1).

CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

This chapter deals with the discussion of the results, research implications, limitations, suggestions, and conclusions drawn from the findings of the study, future study and conclusion. This chapter commences with the discussion that is followed by research implications of the study. Then, limitations of the study are discussed and some suggestions would be provided for future research in this important area. Lastly, an extensive concluding observation would be discussed in this chapter to describe the theme of the study.

Context

The aim of gathering data in this stage was to answer the question asked in this stage *'what are the perspectives of teachers and administrators on the context dimension of B.Ed. (Hons) program?'* Brown (2001) points out that institutional context where teaching is learnt plays a pivotal role in effective teaching. Similarly, Craven (1980) pays importance towards context in teacher education. He emphasizes that the success of a teaching program is mostly influenced by the context.

The findings of the questionnaires regarding context dimension of the program showed that teachers believe that teaching materials of the curriculum attract the attention of the students. Furthermore, teachers are in the opinion that the objectives of the curriculum are clear, achievable and meet the needs of the students regarding teacher education program. There is a balance between theoretical and practical framework of the curriculum, however, the participants have some reservations about the contents of the curriculum which is too extensive for the mental level of the students at this stage as this program is new for the students.

Thus, overall perspectives of the participants on the context dimension of the program are positive. However, it needs some work in the area of content which is lengthy.

Input

The purpose of collection of data in this part is to answer the question asked in this part *'what are the perspectives of teachers and administrators on the input dimension of B.Ed. (Hons) program?'*. The findings of the teachers' questionnaires revealed that the classroom activities play a huge role in order to increase the professional skills of

the students and also boost up concept learning of the students and support students to learn easily. It also showed that the classroom activities such as pair-work and group discussion help students in improving their professional skills and use of audio visual materials has a big impact on shaping and increasing critical thinking in students and dragging the attention of the students. Furthermore, it was indicated in the findings of the survey that the use of audio-visual aids are a great source of help for student teachers in improving their teaching skills which is similar to the findings of a study carried out by Jujjar and Dogar (2006) which compared teacher education program between Plymouth State University, America and Federal College of Education, Pakistan. As a consequence of investigation of responses from both institutes, the scholar summed up that classrooms of Plymouth State University are equipped with AV aids and newest instruments while at Federal College of Education, the teachers have to carry out all tasks with chalk and board. The findings of the interview points out that these materials may have not been properly and efficiently utilized during curriculum or may not have a positive impact on the objectives of the curriculum.

Thus, the teachers and administrators have positive perspectives on the input dimension of this program where AV aids has a huge impact in improving teaching skills and dragging the attention of the students. However, administrators have some reservations on the use of audio-visual materials.

Process

Data were gathered in this section to answer the questions pertaining to the perspectives of teachers and administrators on the process dimension of teacher education program. The findings in this section shows that curriculum is helpful in creating interest and zeal among students to carry out activities and curriculum that is made flexible and easy to bring reformation. With regard to various types of exercises in the curriculum, it promotes critical thinking in students and the activities in the classroom cover all the teaching skills. As Luk (2006) states, use of various activities and exercises have a good impact in enhancing teaching skills. However, participants of interview complained that less time has been allocated for classroom exercises and it is insufficient to conduct classroom activities and demand more time for it. As mentioned in a research study, classroom activities are crucial for effective learning which demands more time so that students can spend more time on classroom exercises (Ramzan, 2002).

Product

Data were collected in this section to answer the questions pertaining to teachers and administrators perspectives on the product dimension of the teacher education program.

The results of survey showed that the curriculum of this program is well suited for the professional needs of the students. Furthermore, the curriculum strengthens learning habits among students, contributes to their field of teaching and meet their individual need which is further supported by a study by Saba (2019), results of which indicated that four years of teacher education program is required as it covers all teaching dimensions and potential to provide all encompassing training to the future teachers. On the other hand, the findings of the interview indicated that curriculum is well designed for the professional needs of the students, but it needs more time in the area of teaching practice. This finding is similar to a study carried out by Aslan (2018) which was to judge teaching practicum subjects in the shape of learner teachers and results of which indicated that time allocated for teaching practice is inadequate, lack of capacity from teachers and prospective teachers were not given adequate knowledge before going for teaching practicum process and it resulted in weak performance in the area of teaching practice. Thus, it can be concluded that the product of the curriculum of the program is well balanced for the professional needs of the students. Nevertheless, it demands more time in the area of teaching practice.

The overall results pertaining to teachers and administrators on the context, input, process and product aspects of the program are positive. The findings revealed that the objectives of the program are well designed and are clear, easy and achievable for the students. Moreover, the use of audio-visual aids has a huge impact in developing teaching skills of the prospective teachers and dragging their attention towards the program. Besides these, classroom activities are well set which promote interest among the students and promote critical thinking among them. It is further indicated that curriculum strengthens learning habit among students, contributes to their field of teaching and meet their individual needs. However, it has some weaknesses such as the content of curriculum is over-burden, less time has been allocated for classroom activities and needs more time and teaching practices are not properly managed which demands more work in this area.

Research Implications

The findings of the current study have theoretical as well as practical contributions. In the following sections, each of them is explained more comprehensively. This study has provided significant contribution in the area of teacher education in the region of Balochistan, Pakistan. This study helped in shaping, revising and explanation for the future research suggestions.

Theoretical Implications

The main purpose of this study was to evaluate teacher education program in the region of Baluchistan, Pakistan using context, input, process and product model. More specifically, this study has added to existing literature on teacher education in Pakistan. This study has extended prior literature carried out in most of the other countries and provided potential to enhance the teacher education literature by understanding the perspectives of teachers, students and administrators. A prior study by Ferda Tunc (2010) on effectiveness of Ankara University Preparatory School Program through the perspectives of instructors and students were conducted. Whereas the current study bridges the gap by focusing the region of Balochistan, Pakistan to have the perspectives of teachers, students and administrators on teacher education program. In addition, this study added to theoretical contribution by using descriptive statistics through mean and standard deviation to analyze data which are less used previously in teacher education. This study also adopted mixed approach of data collection where semi-structured and survey was used to analyze the data in order to have a better understanding of the study.

Practical Implications

From the practical implications, suggestions are provided to the policy makers and the ones who are involved in formulating the curriculum of teacher education to bring reforms in it. It also helps the stakeholders to better understand the problems related to teacher education in Pakistan and overcome them by implementing on the provided suggestions. The findings of the study are very much crucial for the top administrators of the faculty of education in order to help the teachers to better execute the things in the classroom such as participation of teachers and students in the development of curriculum, considering prior knowledge of students, relevancy of AV tools according to teaching methods and more focus on classroom activities and teaching practice. To sum up, it provides key directions to all the stakeholders to keep the above mentioned suggestions in mind in reforming the teacher education program in the country.

SUGGESTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings and discussions of the study, it was revealed that the program needed some revisions in order to improve it. The given suggestions and recommendations might be helpful to improve and revise some dimensions of the program.

- (1) In order to solve this, content needs to be precise according to students' mental level so that students can comprehend it easily.
- (2) Students' prior knowledge needs to be considered while designing the curriculum.
- (3) It is to suggest that the audio-visual tools of the curriculum need to be varied and utilized to complement teaching methods.
- (4) More time needs to be given for classroom activities.
- (5) There should be time scheduled for classroom activities so that students have sufficient time and space to practice classroom activities.
- (6) Teaching practice should be included in every semester of the program so that students get more chance to practice it properly.
- (7) There should be an understanding between departments and the school where students are going for teaching practice so the school administrations take key interest to properly observe the students.

IMPLICATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

In this study, questionnaires and interview were used as the main data collecting tools. Students' skills competencies were determined by self-reported questionnaires so the question here arises on how students perceive their own skills. When their competencies were compared in actual, it might be accurate that they may underestimate or overestimate their skills. Thus, another study can be conducted to make use of various measures

to determine skills competencies such as achievement tests or observations which can be applied to make the evaluation better and more comprehensive.

CONCLUSION OF THE STUDY

Training of teachers has huge importance for producing teachers with better quality, skills and methods so it is highly important to evaluate teacher education programs in order to point out its weaknesses and bring about reforms and improvements. Keeping in view the points mentioned above, this study was designed to evaluate the teacher education program in the region of Balochistan, Pakistan using context, input, process and product model in order to know its weak areas and suggest recommendations for its improvements.

The primary objective of the study was to determine the perspectives of teachers and administrators on teacher education program on the basis of CIPP evaluative model. Moreover, the rationale behind this study was that teacher education in Pakistan is confronted with many issues which gives direction for further research on monitoring system and evaluation for improvements (Begum, 2017). As it was evaluative study, CIPP model was used to evaluate the program. Accordingly, quantitative and qualitative approaches were used for data collection. After reviewing the existing literature, a survey instrument and semi-structured interview were adopted. For the purpose of data collection, a total of 104 self-administered questionnaires for teachers were distributed and 10 administrators were interviewed. Then, the quantitative data were put in SPSS and analyzed through mean and standard deviation and interview data were analyzed through thematic analysis. On the basis of the results of the study, the following conclusions with reference to CIPP evaluation model were derived.

The overall perspectives of teachers and administrators on all four components of the program is positive where the mean value is more than 2.5 which indicates that participants agree about the context, input, process and product of teacher education program. Nevertheless, it needs improvement in the content which is lengthy; more time needs to be allocated for classroom activities, the audio-visual tools of the curriculum need to be varied and utilized to complement teaching methods and special attention should be given to teaching practice.

REFERENCES

- Amanda Briney. (2018). *Geography of Pakistan's Provinces and Capital Territory*.
- Aslan. (2018). Evaluation of teaching practice course according to opinions of student teachers. *Hacettepe Egitim Dergisi*.
- Bahauddin Zakariya University. (2009). *Prospectus. Multan Bahauddin Zakariya University*.
- Begum, S. (2017). New reform in teacher education: An investigation of the implementation of 4-years B.ED. (Hons.) elementary programme in four selected teacher education institutions in Sindh, Pakistan. In *Theses & Dissertations*. https://ecommons.aku.edu/theses_dissertations/779
- Bradley, H., & Devadason, R. (2008). Fractured Transitions: Young Adults' Pathways into Contemporary Labour Markets. *Sociology*.
- Brown, H. D. (2001). *Teaching by Principles An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. New-York Longman. - References - Scientific Research Publishing. (n.d.). Retrieved March 16, 2021, from [https://www.scirp.org/\(S\(351jmbntvnsjt1aadkpozje\)\)/reference/ReferencesPapers.aspx?ReferenceID=1690483](https://www.scirp.org/(S(351jmbntvnsjt1aadkpozje))/reference/ReferencesPapers.aspx?ReferenceID=1690483)
- Craven. (1980). *Academic Program Evaluation*.
- Creswell. (2008). *Creswell, J. W. (2008). Educational research Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*.
- Ferda Tunc. (2010). Evaluation of an English Language Teaching Program At a. In *Master* (Issue January).
- Gay. (2012). *Educational Research*.
- Government of Balochistan. (2011). *Balochistan Education Action Plan* (Issue July).
- Haider. (2008). Challenges in Higher Education: Special reference to Pakistan and South Asian Developing Countries. *Nonpartisan Education Review*.
- Jujjar and Dogar. (2006). *A comparative study of teacher education program offered by Plymouth State University, USA and Federal College of Education, Pakistan*.
- Karatas, H., & Fer, S. (2009). Evaluation of english curriculum at yildiz technical university using cipp model. *Egitim ve Bilim*, 34(153), 47–60.
- Luk. (2006). *Cornerstones of Turkish education from the Ottoman to the post-Republic Turkey: a history of English language teaching in Turkey*.
- Memon, M. (2006). *Mentoring as an alternative approach to in-service teacher education in Balochistan: Some*

- successes and challenges Approach to In-service Teacher Education in Balochistan : January*, 103–117.
- Ministry of Education. (2009). *National Professional Standards for Teachers in Pakistan.pdf*.
- Muhammad, U. (2007). *Pakistan National Education Policy Review White Paper*.
- Powell. (2000). *Elections As Instruments of Democracy: Majoritarian and Proportional Visions*.
- Ramzan. (2002). *A Comparative Study of Teacher Education System of United States of America and Pakistan*.
- Rossi. (2004). *evaluation a systematic approach 2004*.
- Saba. (2019). *SWOT Analysis of B. Ed.(Hons) Program*. 1(1), 103–111.
- Saima. (2013). *Assessing the Effectiveness of Teacher Education Programs : Prospective Teachers ' Perspective*.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (1971). *the Relevance of the Cipp Evaluation Model for Educational Accountability*.
- Ulum, Ö. G. (2016). Evaluation of English as a Foreign Language Program--Using CIPP (Context, Input, Process and Product) Model. *Tojet - The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 1(2), 114–119. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.203077>